

Menachos – Simanim

פרק ד - התכלת

דף מ – 40 Daf

1. *Machlokes* about תכלת on linen garments, and why the Rabbis forbade it

Regarding the obligation of בציצית – a linen cloak in *tzitzis*, Beis Shammai exempts it, and forbids putting *techeiles* on it, because Beis Shammai holds that שטנד was never permitted for *tzitzis* (rather, he must place four white linen threads). Beis Hillel obligates a linen cloak in ordinary *tzitzis* with *techeiles*, because שטנד is overridden for *tzitzis*. Rebbe Elazar bar Tzadok said: – והלא כל המטיל תכלת בירושלים אינו אלא מן המתמיהין – *but anyone who places techeiles* (on linen garments) *in Yerushalayim simply astonishes* everyone who sees it! Rebbe said that since the *halachah* follows Beis Hillel that שטנד is permitted for *tzitzis*, why did they forbid it in Yerushalayim? לפי שאין בקיאים – *Because they are not experts in halachah*. The Gemara assumes this means they are unfamiliar with the special permit for שטנד in *tzitzis*, but objects that we should publicize it. Rava eventually explains they were concerned that one's garment may tear within three fingerbreadths of the corner, which he might sew with linen and leave a thread hanging as *tzitzis*, which is invalid because of "תעשה ולא מן העשוי" – *"you shall make [tzitzis]," and not [use] that which was already made*. Rav Zeira explains they were concerned for שטנד in a כסות לילה – *night garment*, which does not require *tzitzis*, and therefore has no permit for שטנד.

2. Is the *tzitzis* obligation determined by the material of the main garment or the corners?

Rava presented a ruling which was also taught in Eretz Yisroel in Rebbe Zeira's name: – היא של בגד וכנפיה של עור חייבת – *if [the garment] is made of cloth but the corners are made of leather, it is obligated in tzitzis*. היא של עור וכנפיה של – *if [the garment] is made of leather and the corners are made of cloth, it is exempt from tzitzis*. The reason for these *halachos* is עיקר בגד בעיני – *we require the main part of the garment to be of a material obligated in tzitzis*, not its corners. Rav Achai, on the other hand, אדיל בתר כנף – *followed the corner* of a garment in determining whether the garment was obligated in *tzitzis*. Thus, he arrived at the opposite ruling: regardless of what the body of the garment was made of, if the corners were cloth, he required *tzitzis*, and if the corners were leather, he did not require *tzitzis*.

3. תעשה ולא מן העשוי – Adding a fourth corner onto a three cornered garment with *tzitzis*

Rav Huna said: – הטיל לבעלת שלש והשלימה לארבע – *if one placed [tzitzis] on a three-cornered [garment], and then completed it into a four-cornered [garment] and added tzitzis to the fourth corner, פסולה – it is invalid*, משום תעשה – *because of the principle: "You shall make [tzitzis]," and not use that which was already made*. The garment was not subject to *tzitzis* when the first three were placed onto it (since it lacked a fourth corner), and did not fulfill the *mitzvah*. Therefore, after the fourth corner is added, the first three cannot become valid after the fact. The Gemara challenges applying "תעשה ולא מן העשוי" to prematurely attached *tzitzis*, because Rebbe Zeira said: הטיל – *if one placed [tzitzis] on [a garment] which already had [tzitzis] placed onto it, the new tzitzis are valid, even if the original tzitzis are removed*. Although these *tzitzis* were attached when they were not required, they are not disqualified because of "תעשה ולא מן העשוי"? Rava suggests that since adding superfluous *tzitzis* violates "בל" – *do not add to a mitzvah*, their attachment to the garment was not considered "making" *tzitzis* until the original threads are removed. Rav Pappa rejects this answer, because the superfluous *tzitzis* may have been attached to nullify the original threads (and does not violate "בל תוסיף"), and therefore is an event of "making" (invalid) *tzitzis*.

Siman – Pool

The boy from Bnei Brak who astonished the Yerushalmi children when he walked into the pool area wearing a linen garment with *techeiles*, heard the lifeguard who was wearing a wool garment with leather corners and *tzitzis* call out to a boy to stop trying to add a fourth corner on a three corner garment with *tzitzis* because of תעשה ולא מן העשוי.



The boy from *Bnei Brak* who astonished the *Yerushalmi* children when he walked into the pool area wearing a linen garment with *techeiles*, heard the lifeguard who was wearing a wool garment with leather corners and *tzitzis* call out to a boy to stop trying to add a fourth corner on a three corner garment with *tzitzis* because of תעשה ולא מן העשוי.

3 things to remember

1. *Machlokes* about תכלת on linen garments, and why the Rabbis forbade it
2. Is the *tzitzis* obligation determined by the material of the main garment or the corners?
3. תעשה ולא מן העשוי – Adding a fourth corner onto a three cornered garment with *tzitzis*

